



RIKSANTIKVAREN
DIRECTORATE FOR CULTURAL HERITAGE, Oslo, Norway

THE SARMISHSAY PETROGLYPH SITE
NAVOI REGION
NOWBAHOR DISTRICT
THE REPUBLIC OF
UZBEKISTAN

REPORT:
Seventh mission to Sarmishsay
April/May 2009

English edition

Anne-Sophie Hygen
Knut Helskog



Sarpsborg / Tromsø 2009

NAME OF PUBLICATION: Report: 7th mission to Navoi and Sarmishsay,
April-May 2009
*THIS REPORT IS PRINTED
IN AN ENGLISH AND A RUSSIAN
EDITION* Russian edition printed separately.

PROJECT: Conservation and Management of Sarmishsay Cultural and
Natural Heritage Site, Navoi oblast, the Republic of
Uzbekistan

AUTHORS: Anne-Sophie Hygen & Knut Helskog

DEPARTMENT / SECTION: Utviklingsavdelingen (the Conservation department) / the
International section

SUMMARY: The Norwegian following up project mission took place 30
April-10 Mai 2009. The main issue was to evaluate the
project status and results, and to agree on further necessities.
Also, time was allocated for meetings in order to anchor the
further necessary progress.

KEYWORDS: Rock art; petroglyphs; cultural heritage management;
presentation; conservation; ethnography; Sarmishsay;
Uzbekistan

DATE: September 2009

**NUMBER OF COPIES /
PAGES:** 40/21

REG.NR: RA 09-141

COPIES ORDERED AT: postmottak@ra.no

RIKSANTIKVAREN: Dronningens gate 13,
PObox 8196 Dep,
N-0034 Oslo, Norway
Telephone: + 47 22 94 04 00
Telefax: + 47 22 94 04 04
E-mail: postmottak@ra.no
<http://www.riksantikvaren.no/>

Østfold County Council:
PObox 220, N-1702 Sarpsborg, Norway. Tlph: +47 60 11 70 00.
e-mail: sentralpost@ostfoldfk.no

Tromsø University Museum:
N-9037 Tromsø. Tlph: +47 77 64 50 00. e-mail: museumpost@uit.no

Photographs:
Knut Helskog (except where otherwise noted).

Cover photo:
*The Group VIII panels are located at a steep rock surface and can only be seen from the road below.
See close-up photo on page 6 (photo A-S.Hygen).*

Contents

	page
Foreword	4
1. Mission program	5
2. Catching up with delays	6
2.1. The project situation in 2008-2009	6
2.2. Legislation and Kadaster	7
2.3. Museum-Reserve administration and organization	8
3. Project development and evaluation	9
3.1. Results according to plans	9
3.2. On-site preparations for visitation	11
3.3. Documentation	14
3.4. Conservation	14
3.5. Management planning	15
3.6. Information and education	15
4. Meetings	16
5. Work plan 01.07.2009-30.06.2010 (potential)	17
6. The question of the Central Asian Trans-national Serial World Heritage Nomination	19
7. Over-all evaluation and recommendations	19
7.1. Evaluation	19
7.2. Management recommendations and advise	20
8. Conclusions	21

Foreword

The seventh Norwegian following up of the Sarmishsay project, supported by the Norwegian Ministry of Foreign Affairs, took place 29 April-10 May 2009 (including travel days). The main objectives of this year's visit were:

- Evaluation of all activities in 2008;
- Discuss project development and reports;
- Make work priorities for 2009-2010;
- Meetings with decision-makers and contacts.

The Norwegian team this year consisted of project advisers Head of Cultural heritage Dr Anne-Sophie Hygen, Østfold County Council, Sarpsborg, Norway on behalf of Riksantikvaren – the Directorate for Cultural Heritage, Oslo; Professor Dr. Knut Helskog, University of Tromsø and project secretary Anne Blikken, Riksantikvaren.

Our special thanks this year to project leader Dr. Muhiddin Khudjanazarov, to Dr. Kristina Toderich and to Dr. Marina Reutova – invaluable project group partners; to the new Sarmishsay Director Bakhtyor Temirov; to Dr. Alisher Ikramov, the regional UNESCO office in Tashkent; to the new Director of the Gorniy Children's Camp, Marina Valerievna Akasheva, and her staff; and to Head of Department of Environment Protection Viktor Andreevich Grutsinov, Navoi Mining-Metallurgical Combinat (NMMC), for his never-ending and enthusiastic support of Sarmishsay.

In particular, we would like to thank the Khokim¹ of Navoi oblast Erkindjon Okbitaevich Tyrdimov and Deputy Khokim Ali Amonovich Eshongulov, for giving the project group time and attention, and for their understanding and support of improved safeguarding and management of Sarmishsay.

As in previous years, Kristina Toderich and Natalia Shokirova have translated the mission report into Russian, for which we sincerely thank them. The Russian edition of the report is printed separately.

Oslo / Tromsø, September 2009

Anne-Sophie Hygen

Knut Helskog

¹ Khokim (governor) is an administrative and leading person ordered by the President to take control for the economic, cultural and environmental development, management and sustainable use for all resources, including mostly human resources and education, in a region of the Republic.

1. Mission program

- Thursday 30 April: Arrival in Tashkent at 00.55.
Project status up-dates.
Dinner and discussions with Dr Alisher Ikramov, the national UNESCO office.
- Friday 1 May: Train from Tashkent to Samarqand.
Meeting with Dr Shahin Mustafaev, director of International Institute for Central Asian Studies (IIKAS).
- Saturday 2 May: Car from Samarqand to Navoi, then to Sarmishsay.
Meeting with Director Marina Valerievna Akasheva, Gornyi children's camp.
Project discussions.
- Sunday 3 May: Field work in Sarmishsay: Evaluation of work done on the walkways and the groups for visitation.
- Monday 4 May: Project reporting on activities.
Outlines of Project plan 01.01-30.06.2009.
Preparations for meeting with Navoi Xokimiyat.
Financial reporting.
- Tuesday 5 May: Meeting with Navoi Xokim, Erkindjon Okbitaevich Tyrdimov and Deputy Xokim Ali Amonovich Eshongulov in Navoi.
On site overview of conservation activities.
Financial reporting.
Visit from Dr Karoline Miller, OSSE, and her team.
- Wednesday 6 May: Anne Blikken returned to Norway.
Morning and afternoon off.
Discussions of publications in the evening.
- Thursday 7 May: Project work plan 01 July 2009-30 June 2010.
To Samarqand by car.
- Friday 8 May: Project discussions.
- Saturday 9 May: Project group meeting, summing up.
To Tashkent by train.
- Sunday 10 May: Flight from Tashkent at 03:40.



The Group VIII panels are located at a steep rock surface and can only be seen from the road below (cf. front page photo).

2. Catching up with delays

2.1. The project situation in 2008-2009

Due to unsatisfactory project progress and lack of concrete results in 2007, a full published report was not made by the Norwegian advisers after the project visit to Uzbekistan in 2008 (13-25 April including days for travel). Instead, a status report was submitted to Riksantikvaren – the Directorate for Cultural Heritage and the Norwegian Ministry of Foreign Affairs (N-MFA). The Norwegian team in 2008 consisted of project advisers Head of Cultural Heritage Dr Anne-Sophie Hygen, Østfold County Council, Sarpsborg, Norway, Professor Dr Knut Helskog, University of Tromsø, and project secretary Anne Blikken, Riksantikvaren, Oslo.

The situation for 2008 was reviewed during the project visit in April - May 2009 and expected concrete results were formulated. These had to be fulfilled in order for the Norwegian advisers to be able to recommend continued Norwegian support for the rest of the planned project period (→ 30 June 2009). Normally, the next deadline for reporting from the Sarmish group would be the beginning of 2009. However, because of the problems and in order to push the project forward, two reporting dates were set for 2008: 2 May and 15 November. Concrete results were determined to be the preconditions for continued support.

More or less, and to a reasonable degree, the expectations for 2008 were fulfilled. It was acknowledged that some lingering problems were beyond the Sarmish project group to solve. It was – from the Norwegian side – decided not only to recommend continued support for the rest of the planned project period but also to recommend to Riksantikvaren to apply to the N-MFA for funds for an extra project year, 1 July 2009-30 June 2010. If granted by the N-MFA, the advisers' recommendation to accept it or not would be made contingent upon agreed results being reached during the period 1 November 2008-30 June 2009, to be reported by 15 July 2009.

Therefore, during the visit two sets of project activity plans were prepared:

1. For the period ending 30 June 2009
2. For the (potential) period 1 July 2009-30 June 2010.

It was decided that this year's report from the Norwegian team should be written only after having received the report from the Sarmish group (deadline 15 July) in order to be able to evaluate results and reach decisions on further recommendations in the report. The Sarmish Group report was received 11 September, implying delays both in the Norwegian report and in the decision whether to accept the offer from N-MFA or not.



Constant maintenance, doer instance of vegetation, is needed to prevent the vegetation from growing over the walkway. The new director Bakhtyor Temirov at work.

2.2. Legislation and Kadaster

The Uzbek law on monuments of 2002 gave priority to architectural complexes but did not give special attention to archaeological sites and monuments. A new law for the protection and preservation of the archaeological monuments of Uzbekistan was expected to be signed by the President of Uzbekistan.

While the law will say *that* a site is protected, a Kadaster identifies *what* is protected and *how* it is to be managed including the responsibilities and obligations, and it defines activities to be accepted within the defined area: a Kadaster is a collection of official documents connected to

land allocation and use. The new law will greatly influence the future of Sarmishsay, and the Sarmishsay Kadaster on the Republic level will be harmonized with the new law.

The Sarmishsay Kadaster consists of four parts:

1. Land use Kadaster: Implies that land allocation of 5000 ha. be permanently part of State lands as Cultural and Natural Reserve (“Land Use Passport”). Includes topographical maps.
2. Cultural Kadaster: Overview of archaeological monuments and sites, including maps, documentation and scientific reports.
3. Flora, including maps, documentation and scientific report.
4. Fauna, including documentation and scientific report.

Different offices and instances have to accept the Kadaster parts before it is finally signed by the President and becomes part of the Uzbek legislation. The document flow is as follows:

13.09.2004: Resolution by the Nowbahor Khokim, recommending that Sarmishsay becomes Regional Cultural and Natural Museum-Reserve.

30.10.2008: The Navoi Khokim added to the resolution on land allocation of 5000 ha. (north-south 6 km; east-west 8 km. 4650 ha. pastures, 350 ha. unused lands), which now functions as part of the 2004 resolution.

08.04.2009: Certificate of land allocation Kadaster (“passport”) sent from the Nowbahor Khokim to the Navoi Khokim.

14.04.2009: The documents, together with recommendation from the Navoi Khokim, are addressed to the Minister of Culture and Sport but sent to the General Office for Scientific Production for Preservation, who will prepare the case for the Minister.

24.04.2009: The documents within Kadaster part 2 are sent to the Institute of Archaeology, who however asked the Sarmish group for some additional documents before evaluation. The Director appointed a special commission to evaluate the Sarmishsay case.

Next steps:

- The documents within Kadaster part 3 and 4 were sent to State Committee for Nature Protection evaluate (end of June 2009).
- The documents with recommendations will be sent to the State Geological Design Kadaster Department of the Republic of Uzbekistan, who will issue a Republic Certificate to the General Office for Scientific Production for Preservation.
- The General Office will send the Kadaster to the Ministry of Culture and Sport, from there on to the Cabinet Ministry, and finally to the President.

To sum up: As of April 2009, Sarmishsay is established as a Cultural and Natural Museum-Reserve (Muzei-Zapavednik) at oblast level (Navoi). Next step is to get this status at Republic level.

At this point of time nobody is able to know when the Sarmishsay Kadaster will be accepted, signed and stamped all the way to the top.

2.3. Museum-Reserve administration and organization

For several years discussions have been going on as to the administration and organisation of Sarmishsay as a Cultural and natural Museum-Reserve. Several possibilities have been explored and tried out, but without success. This problem seems to be one of the reasons for at least quite a few of the practical management and protection obstacles in Sarmishsay.

Finally, and just before our visit, a new director for Sarmishsay was appointed by the Navoi Khokim, Bakhtyor Temirov. He is to work directly under the Deputy Khokim, and will cooperate closely with the project leader Dr M. Khudjanazarov and the rest of the Sarmish group for as long as the project lasts. Most importantly, the Director and his team will constitute the link between the project and the continuing post-project period.

At oblast level, the function of the Museum-Reserve and a set of statutes for the Director and his office were not completely defined at the time of our visit.



Work is underway to restore an old water mill (route 2, point 7).

3. Project development and evaluation

3.1. Results according to plans

Note: The activities are a combination of the work-plans from the Sarmish Group for the periods 01.04-31.10.2008 and 01.01-30.06.2009 and agreements during our visit.

Activity	Results as of 1 May 2009	Results as of 30 June 2009	Comment
1. Administration and planning			
1a: Kadaster	In progress	In good progress.	See above ch. 2.2.
1b: Infrastructure	Good progress	Good progress.	See above, ch. 2.3.
Permanent approval of the Sarmishsay organisation.	-	Approved by the Khokim of Navoi.	Satisfactory, although concrete issues still to be solved.
1c: Management Plan	Nothing done since December 2007 and adviser's comments	Cooperation with the regional UNESCO office.	Slow progress. See below, ch. 3.5.
Strengthen contacts with institutions and organisations on all levels.	Partly	Progress	Extent unclear.

2. Site infrastructure			
2a: Reconstruction of and equipment in traditional farm house	Not done. Decided to be done at another place on site, and be included in route 1, point 5	Under preparation.	New chosen site for the house is OK. Progress very slow.
2b: Farm-site	Some repairs done. Started to collect equipment. Made a new <i>tandir</i> (clay oven)	Under preparation.	Progress very slow.
Closing of the north gate (has been on the agenda for years)	Not done	Not done.	Must be solved.
Vegetation rehabilitation and bush planting	Going very well.	Going very well.	Good results. Must be maintained.
3. Database, maps and conservation			
3a: Vegetation maps	Finished	-	Good results.
3b: Map of settlements etc.	Finished	-	Good results.
3c: Database up-dating	55% of conservation done; 25% of archaeological sites done. Will continue.	Ongoing.	Slow progress.
3d: Damage documentation	All groups finished, CARAD tables filled out.	-	Good results
3e: Conservation	Progress according to plans.	Going very well.	Good results. See ch. 3.4. below
4. Education, information and tourism			
4a: Visitors' route in north part.	Not done.	Partly done.	In progress.
Finish all visitors' walkways and platforms	Not done.	Progress..	Still some work to be done. Must be maintained.
4b: Information boards and site numbering; strengthen walkways	Not done.	New information board. On-site numbers by viewing points.	Good progress.
4c: Platforms	Not done.	Some lacking.	Slow progress.
Recruit, finance and train sufficient number of guards and guides	Partly, but not sufficient	Still not sufficient.	Slow but steady increase.
Establish and develop a good relationship and cooperation with tourist offices and agencies	Not done.	Still a challenge.	Not satisfactory.
Make appointment with company groups to visit Sarmishsay	In progress (7 so far)	Under development.	Good progress.
5. Research and publications			
5a1: Guidebook according to on-site numbering	Not done *	Russian text finished.	Translations necessary.
Make a simple leaflet (folded page) with map, routes and numbers	Not done.	Not done.	Very simple to do, should be done.
5a2: Booklet on ethnography	First edition Russian version finished **	Finished in Uzbek.	Good results.

5b: Popular-scientific book.	Manuscript still under development ***	Manuscript still under development ***	Slow progress.
5c: Booklet on conservation.	Russian version finished.	English translation in progress.	Satisfactory.
Publish articles in international scientific periodicals.	Many published.	Ongoing.	Good results.
Publish articles from the proceedings of the Regional Conference in Navoi, 2008	In progress.	In progress.	Expected in 2009.

* Should be finished by the end of May, before the tourist season.

Advise: Print a restricted number of copies and give the possibility of revision without large expenses.

** Advise: Let an ethnologist do a scientific quality control.

*** Advise: Cultivate the popular-scientific form (i.e. not too scientific); include ethnography, geology etc.; give focus to the landscape and the different contexts; open up for interpretations.



Horses and anthropomorphs in Saka-Scythian animal style.

3.2. On-site preparations for visitation

Very little, if any, progress on the walkways was detectable at the time of our visit. What was created earlier in the south part of Sarmishsay functioned well, however, and are very discreet and environment friendly. In places, too much vegetation made them less accessible than optional. Still nothing was done in the north part. It was agreed during our visit that all walkways and platforms should be established and functioning by the end of May this year. The Sarmish project leader has decided to create three walkway routes instead of two in order to give visitors a differentiated choice.

According to information received after our visit (cf. the report 01.11.08-30.06.09 from the project group) the three visitors' routes with numbered viewing points, corresponding to a visitors' guide with station information so far in Russian, are now established and functioning. Some platforms are still not created.

The following is a description of the three routes, each with numbered viewing points:

Route 1

No.	Description	Comment
No. 1	Group XIV and Sarmish Kishlak. Introductory signpost	See photo below.
No. 2	Shambar Tepe	Fortified hilltop.
No. 3	Group XIII, geology, nature and vegetation.	Some conservation done (scratches). The path is too narrow.
No. 4	“The King’s Bathroom”	Erosion along the river
No. 5	Ethnology, Arabic inscription, horse coral, Medieval house ruins	Path stone alignments to be looked over.

Route 1 ends by the traditional house. The bridge was taken by a torrent earlier in the year and had to be repaired.



The new information signpost at the south entrance to the site.

Recommendations for the bridge:

Use large natural stones as fundaments, withdrawn from the water on each side. Make it solid in order to withstand torrents. The bridge should be built by high quality round beams, with solid but discreet rails on each side and of maximum length 8 m.

Route 2

No.	Description	Comment
No. 6	Group X	
No. 7	Reconstructed traditional water mill	Work on-going. Path to be made when finished.
No. 8	Group IX *	The stone steps leading up to the path are stable and work well.
No. 9	Along the path. Geology, travertine, snakes. Group VIIIc.	Pines are planted along the river bank for stabilization.
No. 10	New graffiti and Group VIII	
No. 11	Towards Group VII and VI. Kampur Ulde.	

* The conservation works on Group IX works well, but needs maintenance each year.



*Protective works on Group IX (cf. photo in the Norwegian report from 2007, page 15).
Photo: A-S Hygen*

Route 2 ends when descending from Group VII and over new bridge, to be built at the place decided before but not yet made (see Norwegian report from 2005, page 11).

Route 3

Route 3 is in the north part of Sarmishsay. The Route begins after the left turn of the road where it is at its narrowest, right after the new graffiti at no 10.

No.	Description	Comment
No. 12	Group IV (passing Group V which is not to be presented).	A platform must be made in front, a little at distance.
No. 13	Group III.	Graffiti is to be patinated.
No. 14	Group II	Dark geometric figures
No. 15	“Devona kamar”.	
No. 16	Petroglyphs, water spring and flora.	



Camels and dancing (?) men, visitors' route 3.

3.3. Documentation

Group Number	Indexation		Panorama photo		Damage documentation	
	Finished	Not finished	Finished	Not finished	Finished	Not finished
I		x	x			x
II	x		x		x	
III	x		x		x	
IV	x		x		x	1/2
V	1/2	1/2	x		X	
VI	1/2	1/2	x		x	
VII	x		x		x	
VIII a	x		x			x
VIII b		x	x			x
VIII c	x		x			x
IX	x		x		x	
X	x		x		x	
XI	x		1/2	1/2	1/2	1/2
XII	1/2	1/2		x		x
XIII	x		x		x	
XIV	x		x		x	
XV		x		x	x	

3.4. Conservation

As before, the conservation work is led by Dr Marina Reutova with assistant Bakhrudin Boliev. In 2008 they both worked 6 weeks on site. The work is going as scheduled.

Damage documentation

Groups III, IV, VII and XIV are documented. Serious open cracks are detected in group III and IV panels. At group III bits of rock have broken off. Much rains in 2008 caused cracks to be filled with pebbles.

Conservation

A small stone slab roof is constructed over Group VII for protection (see photo). Painted graffiti is cleaned at Group XI, XIV, XIVa, XV. Quite a lot of new graffiti, scratched not painted except by the Camp, is made over the past three years.

A new conservation method is being tested at the test site (near Group VII), adopted from Norway: 97% pure ethanol to clean lichens. So far the method seems to work well, but they will make consultations as to the possible geological reactions.

Hot steam cleaning is applied on Group IX, and it works well.

Monitoring

Monitoring routines are carried out and the routines work well.



The small slab roof over group VII.

3.5. Management planning

No work is done on the Management Plan for the past 1 ½ years. The advised model for Master Plan and Sub-plans (action plans) together with recommendations for major changes in the content were forwarded to the Sarmish group by the Norwegian adviser at that time. During our visit it was decided that a new outline of the action plans be discussed when the group were to meet in Sarmishsay 12 June. A new outline of the Master Plan was planned to be finished within mid September. This does not seem to be fulfilled.

It was later decided to ask the regional UNESCO office to help with the elaboration of the plans, which is a good idea. According to recent information the Management Plan should be finished by the end of 2009 / beginning of 2010.

3.6. Information and education

Guards and guides

The new Director is now in charge of the guards and guides. Three guards and one guide are currently working on site. The project leader educates new guides and guards. Among their duties should be: vegetation management; maintenance of walkways and platforms; garbage cleaning; monitoring of visitors' behaviour; site monitoring. Training must be provided for routine site monitoring and reporting.

The number of guards and guides on site is still much too low, which has been a problem all through the project years. The new Director is strongly advised to increase the number of staff and make sure they are properly trained.

Gornyi Camp teachers

The project leader gives lectures to the camp teachers every year. The lectures contain both information about the cultural and natural site Sarmishsay, and directions for proper behaviour on site.



Dr Muhiddin Khudjanazarov is lecturing a group from Gornyi Childrens' Camp.

Web-site

The web-site has been down for a while. Up-date work is however reported to be ongoing and will be intensified.

4. Meetings

1. Meeting with Dr Alisher Ikramov, the regional UNESCO office

Tashkent, 30.04.09

Basically two items were discussed: The Central Asian serial nomination project (see chapter 6 below) and the Sarmishsay Management Plan. It was agreed to keep an open mind whether to recommend that Sarmishsay go for a separate World Heritage nomination, or to seek nomination within the Central Asian serial nomination package. This will be a matter for the Uzbek authorities to decide,

The UNESCO office personnel are willing to help with the creation of the Management Plan (Master Plan and 3 Sub-plans), which will be very welcome.

2. Meeting with Director Shahin Mustafaev, IICAS

(International Institute for Central Asian Studies)

Samarkand 01.05.09

IICAS very kindly are willing to continue to be the recipient of the Norwegian fund instalments, and to transfer funds at intervals to the Sarmishsay project. From the Norwegian side we are extremely grateful for this invaluable help and support.

3. Meeting with Director Marina Valerievna Akasheva, Gornyi Childrens Camp

Gornyi / Sarmishsay 02.05.09

From the Director's point of view, it is un-acceptable to have tourists passing through the Camp when the children are there. The children must have the maximum security, and this is agreed by all parties. At the present, approximately 2000 visitors a year visit Sarmishsay, but the number may be rapidly growing. The issue must be solved immediately for the short term, and plans must be made to meet a foreseen increase of visitors in the middle- and long terms, which is to be faced in Management Sub-plan 3. From the Norwegian side, we emphasised that such problem-solving is just what action plans are for: the necessity to deal with problems and challenges before they turn into crises.

It is in fact convenient that the number of visitors is so low at the moment, since no measures to face or handle the situation are in place. In the planning process, it is necessary to involve all parties, and to handle all different interests; in this case the Gornyi Camp and the safety and well-being of the camp children in particular. A solution must be found, where visitors are lead beyond the area of the Camp.

4. Meeting with Navoi Khokim, Erkindjon Okbitaevich Tyrdimov

Navoi 05.05.09

The Khokim emphasised that presentation of cultural heritage monuments is a main agenda in Uzbekistan, and several places are opened. He also mentioned other petroglyph sites than Sarmishsay, which are of great importance. Thanks to the letter from the Khokim to the Ministry of Culture and Sport concerning the Kadaster, the regional land allocation and the regional Museum-Reserve, stones are beginning to move.

5. Meeting with Navoi Deputy Khokim, Ali Amonovich Eshongulov

Navoi 05.05.09

The Sarmishsay Museum-Reserve organisation and administration is directly under the Deputy Khokim, and the Director reports to him. He said it was his dream to bring Sarmishsay out to people and into the light, and that he hoped his dream would come true. He would now give more attention to the issue, and help as much as possible. It would be necessary to find good solutions for tourism and the possibility for tourist accommodation, to show hospitality and to emphasise the beauty of the site.

5. Work plan 01.07.2009-30.06.2010 (potential)

After discussions in Sarmishsay 07.05.2009 between the Sarmish team and the Norwegian advisers, it was decided to revise the potential project work plan for the period 01.07.09 – 30.06.10. The objective was to create a more concrete, realistic and action oriented plan in order to reach the expected results by the end of the Norwegian-supported project. The question of potential recommendations for another year of project would be contingent upon an evaluation of results as of 30 June 2009, to be reported by 15 July (see chapter 8 below).

The revised work-plan was accepted by the Sarmish project leader and the Norwegian advisers, and sent together with a memorandum to N-MFA 11 May 2009:

Activity 1: Administration and planning

1.1. Administration

- a). Establish permanent office in Navoi.
- b). Get the administrative structure in order and working.
- c). Staff: Sufficient number of guards and guides (3 guards and 1 guide today); accountant; specialist on eco-tourism coordination and development.
- d). Budget / reliable financing (both from International donors and the Government of Uzbekistan).
- f). Ticket system (at present 5000 Sum; should differentiate between different categories of visitors).
- h). Security (contract with police department)

1.2. Planning

- a). Management plan (Master Plan 3 Sub/plans / action plans).
Cooperation with the regional UNESCO office and the Sarmishsay project group.

Activity 2: Infrastructure

1. Walkways with signs (numbers) and solid platforms (group 3, 4,14, 6).
2. Bridges (most important; high priority).
3. Prevention of water erosion: stabilization of river banks.
4. Shepard's' house including "aivon" (start building in July 2009).
5. Introduction information boards in the north and south (with map of walkways etc).
6. Reconstruction of water reservoir and reopening of the old water channels.
7. Culture Center in traditional style (dependant on the Uzbek Government allocating financial support).



The cooking area with a new "tandor" outside the shepherd's house.

Activity 3: Documentation and conservation

3.1. Documentation and database

- a). Continued documentation of petroglyphs: Group I, XV, XIVa, VIIIa, V (project leader with assistant).
- b). Database up-date.
- c). Vegetation monitoring.
- d). Monitoring of archaeological monuments.

3.2. Conservation and monitoring

- a). Go on as before. Conservation of Group XIVa, III, II, IV, I.
- b). Conservation monitoring to be continued.

c). Loading conservation data into database.

Activity 4: Public awareness and training

1. Guidebook with information according to the site number system (translations into Uzbek and English).
2. Guards and guides: appoint and train (series seminars and field work).
3. Local involvement and education. Revival of traditions through handicrafts development.
4. Teaching programs for secondary schools and specialized gymnasiums on cultural heritage conservation and presentation; establishment of ‘children’s movement’ and “Friends of Sarmishsay”.

Activity 5: International and regional cooperation

1. Cooperation with the other Central Asian countries on the trans-boundary serial-nomination project.
2. Continued cooperation with Norway.

6. Publications

1. Booklet on conservation (Uzbek, Russian, English) (late summer 2009)
2. Booklet on ethnography (Uzbek, Russian) (late summer 2009)
3. Popular-scientific book on the petroglyphs and archaeology of Sarmishsay
4. Booklet on the natural environment.

6. The question of the Trans-national Serial World Heritage Nomination of Central Asian petroglyph sites

In the early project plans for Sarmishsay, to get the site inscribed in the UNESCO World Heritage List was one of the stated end goals. In the meantime, UNESCO initiated a project on trans-national serial nomination of petroglyph sites in Central Asia, concerning Uzbekistan, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Tajikistan and Turkmenistan. Tamgaly in Kazakhstan is already on the List, and of the other planned sites Sarmishsay is in the front concerning documentation, scientific work and protection regimes. A concept paper is scheduled to be finished in the autumn 2009, and a regional meeting dealing with this document and future following up will take place at the end of 2009 / beginning of 2010.

It will be entirely up to the Uzbek authorities to decide whether to go for a separate nomination or to be part of the joint serial nomination. The Norwegian advisers will refrain from giving recommendation.

7. Over-all evaluation and recommendations

7.1. Evaluation

A problem all through the project years has been that progress has been slow, and at several points of time the project has more or less come to a halt. There are several and different reasons for this, some of which have been difficult or impossible to foresee or to deal effectively with. In general, basic reasons have been that too little work power and resources have been allocated from the Uzbek side, and that project work has not been made a priority at all times, neither by the Uzbek authorities nor by the project group itself. There has been a

clear tendency of periodical all-out efforts, a circumstance which has been counter-productive to a preferred regular performance. The project has in many ways been too dependant upon the Norwegian support, financially and otherwise.

In order to bring the project well through its final stage, to reach the goals and to come to a point of regular management it is a precondition that the concerned Uzbek authorities make Sarmishsay a priority. Another precondition is that the project participants allocate enough time and work, and that the project group is sufficiently strengthened by finances and work power.

In order to push the project forward a set of preconditions were defined following the Norwegian visit in 2008 and during the visit in 2009. Results reached as of 30 June 2008, to be reported by 15 July, were made the condition for further project support, provided that the N-MFA decided to allocate funds for another project year, 2009-2010.



The upper part of Group VII constitutes the finest panels on the second route.

Some time after our visit the N-MFA did allocate funds for an additional project year, meaning that it would be up to the Norwegian advisers whether to recommend it or not; it would be contingent upon results being reached and reported by mid July.

Although the report was very late in coming, but it shows that a considerable amount of constructive work and results are reached; such as:

- The basic organization structure is in place but still with some unclear points;
- The Kadaster is working its way through the system;
- The walkways with routes, viewing points and numbering is in place, corresponding to a guide book;
- Conservation and monitoring is going well;
- Documentation and database loading is gradually reaching its first conclusion;
- The publications are partly finished, partly under way.

7.2. Management recommendations and advise

From the Norwegian side, we would like to give the following recommendations and advise for the future continuing work:

- Appoint a governing board with expertise and representatives of owners (Khokimyat) and stake-holders (like the Gornyi Camp), to be responsible for budget and main activities, to contribute positively and to come up front of problems.
- Get the Museum-Reserve financial situation quickly in order.
- Increase the security on site to avoid misuse and damages.
- Keep good cooperation with the land-owners and keep control that the protected area is not used destructively (for instance: building, over-grazing etc).
- Keep up grazing in defined areas and according to a stated regime, in order to avoid that the vegetation growth gets out of control.
- Define activities according to defined zones.
- Channel income from visitors (admission fee, sales etc) back to the management of Sarmishsay.
- Keep scientific competence within the future site management.
- Quickly solve the question of visitors' admission in cooperation and understanding with the Gornyi Camp interests, in the short-, middle- and long perspectives.
- Restrict information boards to entrance and resting areas.
- Carry on yearly conservation works.
- Create and keep up all monitoring routines.
- Make sure the Management Plan (when it is finished and approved) is followed and respected, and that there are finances to do it.
- Formulate rules of behaviour (visitors, researchers, others).

8. Conclusions

From the start of the project, and following a pre-project in 2003, the Norwegian project support was scheduled to last for 3 years over a period of 4 calendar years, 2004-2007. Thanks to flexibility and understanding of problems from N-MFA and Riksantikvaren, project extensions were accepted and fresh funds provided.

It is a common wisdom that a project should not last too long; this is the nature of projects – they are, and must be, temporary only. At some point of time they must come to a halt and regular work begin.

However, there have been problems all through the project period, some of which have been beyond the project group to solve. Also, this kind of work is in many ways a pilot project in Uzbekistan, lots of new ground has had to be ploughed, and experience is compiled. All in all a large number of concrete results have been reached, which is to be respected and recognized.

There are, however, still major structural and organizational issues which lack conclusions. To have the Norwegian financial and advisory support for a while longer may help pave the way for satisfying solutions and contribute to solving of some problems. The Norwegian advisers therefore have concluded that the project should continue until 30 June 2010, which is our recommendation to Riksantikvaren and the N-MFA.